



31 March 2014
ORIGINAL: SPANISH



Fourth [virtual] meeting of the Working Group on
Capacity-Building and Cooperation established in the
Plan of Action to 2014 of the Declaration on the
Application of Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration
On Environment and Development in
Latin America and the Caribbean

Friday, 28 March 2014

[This document has not been through editorial revision]

MINUTES – SUMMARY OF THE MEETING

1. BACKGROUND

The Plan of Action to 2014 for the implementation of the Declaration, adopted in April 2013 in Guadalajara, Mexico, established two working groups for the advancement towards the formulation of a regional instrument. According to the Plan of Action to 2014, the objective of the Working Group on Capacity-building and Cooperation is to formulate a proposal to intensify regional and international cooperation on the basis of the training and financing needs and options, both for the public sector and the public in general. In addition, at the Third meeting of the Focal Points designed by the governments of the signatory countries of the Declaration on the application of Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, held in Lima, in October 2013, the following priority action lines were agreed in capacity-building and cooperation:

1. The group will focus during 2014 in identifying the best practices in the region with regard to access to information, participation and justice in environmental matters in order to contribute to the discussion on the specifics of the regional instrument and the regional standard. The group values the report “Access to information, participation and justice in environmental matters in Latin America and the Caribbean: Situation, outlook and examples of good practice” developed by the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC), and requests ECLAC to deepen the knowledge of the best practices in the region.
2. The group encourages signatory countries to develop national and regional capacity-building activities during 2014 to promote the implementation of Principle 10 and the Declaration. Understanding that, even though working in all access rights is a

commitment of the signatory countries, it is necessary to concentrate special efforts in the advancement of the access to justice and capacity-building in this area.

3. The group encourages signatory countries to search ways to include supporting capacity-building other organizations related with the topic of the process. Additionally, as mentioned at the working group meetings, in order to take advantage of the training resources it is important to detect the multipliers from the different sectors.
4. The group encourages international organizations to support these efforts at the national level and to continue working together with the ECLAC to promote regional capacity-building. In this context, the group values the joint capacity-building workshops organized by ECLAC, the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), the World Resources Institute-The Access Initiative (WRI-TAI) and other organizations such as the Peruvian Society for Environmental Law (SPDA) and the Caribbean Academy for Law and Court Administration (CALCA), the educational arm of the Caribbean Court of Justice (CCJ).
5. The group encourages signatory countries and the interested public to develop educational materials and timely reporting, and to make training resources available to the Technical Secretariat in order for the Secretariat to create and maintain a register updated periodically on the Web.
6. The group will review the outcomes of the two regional capacity-building workshops undertaken within this process, and will propose two capacity-building priorities for each of the three pillars of Principle 10. They will be presented at the 4th meeting of the working group.
7. The group encourages signatory countries and the interested public to link the Principle 10 with other on-going international process on the post-2015 United Nations development agenda.

Below is a summary of the development and conclusions of the fourth virtual meeting of the Working Group on Capacity-Building and Cooperation, which had as its objective the definition of the main tasks to be carried out by the Working Group in 2014 so as to fulfill the aforementioned aims and the calendar for the year. Attached in Annex I is the list of participants of the meeting.

2. DEVELOPMENT OF THE MEETING

In the welcoming words, ECLAC highlighted the interest aroused by the meeting and informed that El Salvador had recently joined the Declaration.

Afterwards, the coordinators of the Working Group (Colombia and Jamaica) summarized the objectives of the Working Group and the actions carried out since its establishment. The

coordinators especially pinpointed the three training workshops organized during 2013 (Jamaica in March; Trinidad and Tobago in September; and Lima in October).¹

The delegate from Colombia, as one of the coordinators of the Working Group, then presented a proposal of the main tasks to be carried out in 2014 with an emphasis on i) fostering national and regional actions in the implementation of Principle 10 and identification of best practices, and ii) incorporation of capacity-building and cooperation into the future regional instrument. The coordinators' proposal, which includes a calendar for 2014, is outlined in Annex 2.

The coordinators' proposal foresees the invitation of the signatory countries to organize at least one national training activity during the next 6 months, hold a regional workshop during the year with the aim of sharing best practices so as to contribute to the discussions on the content of the future instrument and study the functioning and effectiveness of cooperation mechanisms included in the different environmental and regional instruments.

As agreed in Lima, the coordinators then presented a proposal of two priorities per pillar of Principle 10. The proposal can be found in Annex 3. As mentioned in the document containing the proposals, the latter seeks to guide efforts to carry out regional actions. It is also intended to be a guideline for those activities that countries would like to undertake at the national and regional level to raise awareness of the public and Government officials on rights and obligations regarding access to information, participation and justice in environmental matters.

In the debate which followed the presentation made by the coordinators, ECLAC stressed the importance of generating synergies between both working groups established in the Plan of Action to 2014 with the aim of advancing towards the adoption of a regional instrument.

The delegate from Chile thanked the coordinators for their proposal, to which they were able to provide their input as Presiding Officers. She recalled that 2014 was an extremely challenging year since the Plan of Action would come to an end and advances needed to be made towards a regional instrument. For this reason, she expressed her support for the idea of focusing on the incorporation of capacity-building and cooperation in the regional instrument this year and undertook to contribute to this end.

The delegates from Argentina, Dominican Republic, Honduras, Paraguay and Uruguay welcomed the joining of El Salvador to the process and requested that the proposals of the coordinators be sent to them for their consideration. The delegate from Dominican Republic added that it was important to concentrate efforts in strengthening the establishment of the instrument in the region and that knowing the efforts of other agencies was necessary to bring them in line with the process.

A member of the public underlined the coordinators' proposals and put forward two ideas. The first referred to the inclusion of a long-term training programme under the auspices of the regional instrument aimed at building capacities in the public and judicial sectors as well as in the general public. The second made reference to the consideration of a fund for capacity-

¹ More information on these workshops is available in the webpage of the process: www.cepal.org/rio20/principio10.

building which would allow the channeling of contributions made by possible donors into activities for the full application of Principle 10 in the region.

The delegate from Guatemala highlighted the proposal of considering the establishment of a fund to finance capacity-building initiatives in the instrument. With respect to the proposal of inter-institutional coordination at the national level made by the working group coordinators, she indicated that Guatemala would soon announce the appointment of two focal points for the implementation process of the Declaration on Principle 10, one from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and one from the Ministry of the Environment, so as to improve internal coordination.

A member of the public indicated that capacity-building and cooperation were weakly included in the Aarhus Convention, main reference of instruments for the full application of Principle 10 de the Rio Declaration, but underlined the importance of learning from the Economic Commission for Europe's experience, under the wing of the Convention, so as to raise awareness in view of its adequate inclusion in the future regional instrument.

The representative from UNITAR expressed her desire to support capacity-building in the region, reason for which they had sent a note to all signatory countries so as to guide their efforts in the search for financing for the carrying out of activities in this field. She also invited those who had not done so to reply to the note.

The delegate from Peru thanked the delegates for their proposal and highlighted the importance of training civil servants and sharing experiences to guarantee the access of indigenous communities to environmental information, participation and justice. Both issues were also underpinned by members of the public from Mexico and Colombia.

Members of the public from different universities of the region gave an account of their follow-up of the implementation of the Declaration and expressed their intention of contributing to this aim by providing substantive information to support the decision-making process. At the same time, they inquired about the role of civil society in the trainings.

ECLAC recalled the intention of the signatory countries of adopting a regional instrument for the full application of Principle 10 in Latin America and the Caribbean with the significant participation of all interested citizens, as indicated in the Declaration. It recalled that with this in mind, the rules of procedure for the participation of the public in the process (including trainings) were established in the Plan of Action of Guadalajara. It also highlighted the contributions made by civil society organizations and academia in the region with respect to trainings in access rights and awareness-raising and invited them to actively collaborate in the implementation of the Declaration.

A member of the public from Mexico sent his contributions in writing indicating that it was his understanding that capacity-building efforts, agreements and processes at the national and regional levels should result in practical implementations for local governments, urban communities and rural areas, with indicators that would allow to monitor and evaluate results and impact continuously in their society. He gave details about a game for primary school children which allows parents to transmit civic, social and environmental values. He also added

that indicators to measure performance and impact in society would be the object of a publication that would be published between July and August. He also inquired about the existence of similar initiatives².

3. AGREEMENTS

- It was agreed that the proposal of the 2014 lines of action and priority areas per pillar of the Principle would be sent by e-mail to all participants, for their consideration and commentaries.
- It was agreed that the deadline to make comments and observations would be Tuesday, 15 April 2014 and that final version of the proposal and priorities, including the calendar of activities for 2014 would be sent to all participants and uploaded to the website the week of 20 April.

² More information can be found at: <http://www.jsxxi.org/>

ANEXO 1 / ANNEX 1
LISTA DE PARTICIPANTES / LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

**A. Países signatarios de la Declaración /
Signatory countries of the Declaration**

ARGENTINA

Otros participantes/ Other participants:

- Brenda Mariana Pangrazi, Secretario de Embajada, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto

CHILE

Otros participantes/ Other participants:

- Jacqueline Ladino, Dirección de Medio Ambiente y Asuntos Marítimos, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores
- Francisca Farías, Oficina OCDE y Foros Internacionales, Ministerio de Medio Ambiente

COLOMBIA

Punto focal/ Focal Point:

- María Angélica García, Segundo Secretario de Relaciones Exteriores, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores

COSTA RICA

Punto focal/ Focal Point:

- Mariamalia Jiménez, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores

GUATEMALA

Otros participantes/ Other participants:

- Paola Andrea Morris, Coordinadora, Unidad de Relaciones y Cooperación Internacional, Ministerio de Ambiente y Recursos Naturales

HONDURAS

Otros participantes/ Other participants:

- Xiomara Cubas, Coordinadora Técnica y Administrativa del Consejo Nacional de Desarrollo Sostenible (CONADES)

JAMAICA

Punto focal/ Focal Point:

- Princess Gordon, Documentation/Information and Access Service Director, Ministry of Water, Land, Environment and Climate Change

MÉXICO/MEXICO

Otros participantes / Other participants:

- Berta Helena de Buen, Directora General Adjunta de Participación y Atención Ciudadana, Secretaría de Medio Ambiente y Recursos Naturales

- Vicente Silva Liga, Subdirector de Participación Social, Secretaría de Medio Ambiente y Recursos Naturales
- Miguel C. Molina, Subdirector de Asuntos Internacionales de Acceso, IFAI, México
- María del Rosario Vásquez Rosales, IFAI, México

PARAGUAY

Otros participantes / Other participants:

- Mario Ruiz Díaz, Dirección de Planificación y Políticas Públicas, Gobierno de Paraguay
- Cristhian Pascottini, Dirección de Planificación y Políticas Públicas, Gobierno de Paraguay
- Marta León, Dirección de Planificación y Políticas Públicas, Gobierno de Paraguay
- Martín Villalba, Dirección de Planificación y Políticas Públicas, Gobierno de Paraguay

PERÚ/PERU

Puntos focales/ Focal Points:

- Mariano Casto Sánchez Moreno, Viceministro de Gestión Ambiental, Ministerio del Ambiente
- Sonia María Gonzales, Directora General de Investigación e Información Ambiental, Ministerio del Ambiente

Otros participantes / Other participants:

- Carlos Rossi, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores del Perú

REPÚBLICA DOMINICANA/DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Punto focal/ Focal Point:

- Tirsis Quezada, Directora de Planificación y Desarrollo del Ministerio de Medio Ambiente y Recursos Naturales

URUGUAY

Punto focal/ Focal Point:

- Alison Graña, Secretario del Servicio Exterior, Dirección de Medio Ambiente, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores

C. Organismos de Naciones Unidas / United Nations bodies

Instituto de las Naciones Unidas para Formación Profesional e Investigaciones / United Nations Agency for Training and Research (UNITAR)

- Vera Barrantes, Specialist, Chemicals and Waste Management Programme
- Carlos Alberto Suárez Marín, Individual Contractor, Chemicals and Waste Management Programme

D. Público / Public

- Tanya Almanzar
- Carolina Álvarez, periodista, Chile
- Gabriel Araya Ahumada, Center for Climate and Resilience Research
- Daniel Barragán, Centro Ecuatoriano de Derecho Ambiental, Ecuador
- Sherrie Baver, Professor of Political Science, CUNY, United States
- Astrid Milena Bernal Rubio, Abogada, Asociación Ambiente y Sociedad, Colombia
- Gabriela Burdiles Perucci, Directora de proyectos FIMA, Chile
- Isabel Calle Valladares SPDA, Perú
- Sharon Zabarburu Chávez, SPDA, Perú
- Olimpia Castillo Blanco, Comunicación y Educación Ambiental SC
- Chiara Costanzo, Phd candidate, National University of Ireland, Ireland
- Jaime Delgado, sociólogo, Chile
- Juan José Dimas, El Otro Medio, Argentina
- Noel Ehrler, Chile
- Daniela Erazo, Centro Ecuatoriano de Derecho Ambiental, Ecuador
- Margarita Flórez, Directora Ejecutiva, Asociación Ambiente y Sociedad, Colombia
- Alexandra Freitas, AC Acceso Ciudadano, Venezuela
- Luis Alberto Gallegos, Periodista consultor ambiental, Chile
- Natalia Gómez Peña, Abogada Investigadora, Asociación Ambiente y Sociedad, Colombia
- Renato Morgado, Imaflora, Brazil
- Carolina Neme, abogada
- Valeria Noé Figueroa, Chile
- Francisco Olivares, Chile
- Rodolfo Daniel Olivari, Argentina
- Florencia Ortúzar Greene, Asesora Legal, AIDA, Chile
- Cirilo Antonio Otero, Presidente, Centro de Iniciativas de Políticas Ambientales, Nicaragua
- Eavin Parry
- Francisca Reyes, Chile
- Elba Romero, Argentina
- Lalanath de Silva, Director, The Access Initiative, United States
- Eduardo Vergara Lope de la Garza, Director, Juventud Siglo XXI A.C., México
- Francisco Vicencio, Chile

E. Secretaría / Secretariat

Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe (CEPAL)/Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC)

- Carlos de Miguel, Jefe de la Unidad de Políticas para el Desarrollo Sostenible, División de Desarrollo Sostenible y Asentamientos Humanos/Head of the Policies for Sustainable Development Unit, Sustainable Development and Human Settlements Division

- Valeria Torres, Oficial de Asuntos Económicos, División de Desarrollo Sostenible y Asentamientos Humanos/Economic Affairs Officer, Sustainable Development and Human Settlements Division
- David Barrio, Oficial de Asuntos Políticos, División de Desarrollo Sostenible y Asentamientos Humanos/Political Affairs Officer, Sustainable Development and Human Settlements Division

ANNEX 2
**PROPOSAL: ACTION LINES FOR THE WORKING GROUP FOR STRENGTHENING
THE NATIONAL CAPACITIES AND INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION ON
PRINCIPLE 10 OF THE RIO DECLARATION**

1. INTRODUCTION

On March 6th 2014, a virtual meeting took place between the board of the Principle 10 Declaration (Chile, Mexico, ECLAC), and the coordinators of the Working Group on Capacity Building and International Cooperation (Colombia and Jamaica). As a result of this meeting, participants agreed to the elaboration of the “Lines of Action” document, in order to define the actions that the working group will carry out during 2014, as well as a schedule to meet the proposed activities.

To date, it has been agreed an Action Plan (2013-2014) where countries are committed to work in advance of full implementation of Principle 10 at national level. During the last physical meeting of the Working Group, held in Lima in October 2013, seven (7) priority areas were proposed and discussed to determine which priority areas would form the focus of actions and activities of the Working group during 2014.

Also, during the virtual meeting of March 6, it was discussed that the work of the Cooperation Group should be integrated in the work of the Regional Instrument, which is also reported in the minutes of that meeting more broadly. .

In this regard, in order to work in the priority areas, continue the work of the group, and discuss how to coordinate them with the Regional Instrument; it is proposed to work in two ways: Strengthening National Capacities and Development of the Regional Instrument.

2. AREAS OF ACTION

- Identify the most relevant National Capacities for the application of the Principle 10 in each country in order to conclude a regional common framework.
- Discuss alternatives to integrate the activities of the Working Group with the development of a regional instrument, so that it is guaranteed the coordination of actions and activities for implementing the Principle 10 at national and regional level.

3. NATIONAL AND REGIONAL ACTIVITIES

Progress in Strengthening National Capacities is essential to promote the recognition of the importance of access to information, participation and justice in environmental matters nationwide. It is essential that national and regional authorities to be the first actors to understand

the importance of effective implementation of Principle 10 in their the country, so that they become the first multipliers of this principle. Importantly, these entities are those with the ability to integrate the goals of Principle 10 into public policies and activities that have a real impact on the population.

These activities will be focused on complying with the terms of the main objective of the action plan for the Working Group, i.e. "make a proposal for strengthening regional and international cooperation in accordance with the needs and training options and funding both the public sector and the public in general."

In this regard, it should be noted that the Working Group plays a leading role in the implementation process of the Principle 10 in each of the nations. Firstly, inviting signatories of the Declaration to undertake activities to advance its implementation. Second, generating proposals and suggestions that countries, if they choose, be used to extend the training program to the different actors in each of these countries. Finally, coordinating the technical and training needs of the countries, with the supply of services of organizations like UNEP and UNITAR to Strengthen National Capacities. Importantly, it is recommended to have the support of ECLAC, since in its his capacity as Technical Secretariat becomes a fundamental component to advance in national and regional training.

With this in mind it is proposed that:

3.1 Actions:

1. Through a letter issued by ECLAC as Technical Secretariat, invite the signatories to develop at least one national training activity during the first half of 2014. This activity may include workshops, conferences, symposia, etc.
2. Designing a standardized format for homogeneous collection of Best Practices conducted in different countries. Attached hereto format proposal, stating that any proposal is welcome from another country or ECLAC

3.2 Activities

1. Develop specific training activities based on the priorities identified at the meeting in Lima in 2013.
2. Identify best practices for strengthening National Capacities that are being developed in different countries.
3. Identify national multipliers and carry out an approach to them in order to enhance the training.
4. Establish an interagency coordination in order to manage national processes jointly.

- Conduct a regional workshop at the end of the first quarter, which serves as a place for sharing best practices identified by countries in the implementation of Principle 10. This aims to turn choose which would be applicable to the region such practices. This aims to choose which would be the best practices applicable to the region. Also during the workshop will seek to study what is the best mechanism for the exchange and implementation of these practices in the region.

REGIONAL MECHANISM

In addition to capacity building at the national level, it will be working on the development of a regional instrument. This regional instrument must be formulated in such a way as to integrate the objective of the working group to develop national capacities to coordinate the efforts of both national and regional levels.

Set to consider:

- Study the operation and effectiveness of the cooperation mechanisms present in the different instruments of environmental or regional character.
- Submit up to 3 possible alternative mechanisms for cooperation and exchange of good practices among countries, in the proposed regional workshop at the middle of the first quarter.

4 SCHEDULE

NATIONAL LEVEL		REGIONAL LEVEL	
<i>Date</i>	<i>Activity</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Activity</i>
March 28 : 4th virtual meeting.	The document “Action lines” will be presented for consideration of the Working Group.	July- August Regional Workshop	Exchange of experiences and national processes results. Cooperation mechanism proposal.
April - May	Carrying national activity	November: 4th meeting of focal points	Adoption of the cooperation mechanism to be applied at the regional mechanism.
May: 5th virtual meeting.	Analysis of national processes		

ANNEX 3
PRELIMINARY PROPOSAL OF TRAINING PRIORITIES FOR EACH PILLAR OF
PRINCIPLE 10

Background: At the Third meeting of the focal points appointed by the Governments of the signatory countries of the Declaration on the application of Principle 10 of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development in Latin America and the Caribbean, held in Lima, in October 2014, it was agreed that the Working Group on Capacity Building and Cooperation would review the outcomes of the two regional training workshops held as part of the process, and would propose two training priorities for each of the three pillars of Principle 10, to be presented at the Fourth meeting of the Working Group.

Hereafter is a proposal on training priorities for each of the three pillars of Principle 10 for the consideration of signatory countries based on the information gathered in the workshops and dialogues held at working group meetings as well at those of signatory countries. This proposal seeks to guide efforts to implement regional actions and provide guidance for activities that countries wish to undertake at the national level, notwithstanding other actions developed at both regional and national levels to raise awareness of the public and Government officials on the rights and obligations regarding access to information, participation and justice in environmental matters.

PILLAR	PRIORITIES
Access to information	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dissemination of good practices both on active and passive transparency 2. Mechanisms on how environmental information such as Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers, can be accessed.
Access to participation	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Dissemination of good practices to promote the participation of groups traditionally underrepresented in decision-making 2. Knowledge exchange on public participation at the policies, plans and programmes level
Access to justice	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Training and awareness of judges and judicial officers on environmental issues 2. Exchange of experiences and good practices on access to justice in environmental matters